

TSBB06 Multi-Dimensional Signal Analysis, Solutions 2021-01-12

1. (a) We compute the distances

$$d_{PD}(\mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{l}) = |(\text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_1)^\top (\text{norm}_D \mathbf{l})| = \left| (1, 2, 1) \cdot \frac{1}{13}(12, -5, 26) \right| = \frac{28}{13},$$

$$d_{PD}(\mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{l}) = |(\text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_2)^\top (\text{norm}_D \mathbf{l})| = \left| (2, -1, 1) \cdot \frac{1}{13}(12, -5, 26) \right| = \frac{55}{13},$$

$$d_{PD}(\mathbf{x}_3, \mathbf{l}) = |(\text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_3)^\top (\text{norm}_D \mathbf{l})| = \left| (-1, 5, 1) \cdot \frac{1}{13}(12, -5, 26) \right| = \frac{11}{13}.$$

Since \mathbf{x}_4 is an ideal point and $\mathbf{l}^\top \mathbf{x}_4 \neq 0$, it lies infinitely far away from the line.

Answer: Of the four points, the point \mathbf{x}_3 lies closest to the line \mathbf{l} .

- (b) All points on the line are formed as a linear combination of \mathbf{x}_1 and \mathbf{x}_2 , and since both of those are proper points, the ideal point can be computed as

$$\mathbf{x}_\infty \sim \text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_2 - \text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_1 = (1, -3, 0).$$

Answer: The ideal point on the line through \mathbf{x}_1 and \mathbf{x}_2 is $\mathbf{x}_\infty = (1, -3, 0)$.

- (c) The points (in the extended Euclidean plane) with homogeneous coordinates \mathbf{x}_1 , \mathbf{x}_2 , and \mathbf{x}_3 lie on a line if and only if their *triple product* is zero, i.e. $\mathbf{x}_3^\top (\mathbf{x}_1 \times \mathbf{x}_2) = 0$. If \mathbf{x}_1 and \mathbf{x}_2 are distinct, then $\mathbf{l}_{12} = \mathbf{x}_1 \times \mathbf{x}_2$ represents the line through \mathbf{x}_1 and \mathbf{x}_2 , and $\mathbf{x}_3^\top \mathbf{l}_{12} = \mathbf{x}_3^\top (\mathbf{x}_1 \times \mathbf{x}_2) = 0$ means that \mathbf{x}_3 also lies on this line. If \mathbf{x}_1 and \mathbf{x}_2 are not distinct, the three points automatically lie on a line, and the triple product also clearly becomes zero.

Using the three points in the problem text, we get

$$\mathbf{x}_3^\top (\mathbf{x}_1 \times \mathbf{x}_2) = (-1, 5, 1) \cdot ((1, 2, 1) \times (2, -1, 1)) = (-1, 5, 1) \cdot (3, 1, -5) = -3 \neq 0,$$

so the points do not lie on a line.

Answer: Three points lie on a line if their triple product is zero.

2. (a) **Answer:** A general element $\mathbf{T} \in \mathcal{A}$ can be written as

$$\mathbf{T} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{A} & \mathbf{t} \\ \mathbf{o}^\top & 1 \end{pmatrix},$$

where \mathbf{A} is a non-singular 3×3 matrix and $\mathbf{t} \in \mathbb{R}^3$. It follows that \mathbf{T} has $3 \cdot 3 + 3 = 12$ degrees of freedom.

- (b) If points are transformed by the transformation \mathbf{T} , then planes are transformed using the *dual transformation*

$$\tilde{\mathbf{T}} = \mathbf{T}^{-\top} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{A}^{-1} & -\mathbf{A}^{-1}\mathbf{t} \\ \mathbf{o}^\top & 1 \end{pmatrix}^\top = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{A}^{-\top} & \mathbf{o} \\ -\mathbf{t}^\top \mathbf{A}^{-\top} & 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Transforming the plane at infinity, $\mathbf{p}_\infty = (\mathbf{o}, 1)$, we get $\tilde{\mathbf{T}}\mathbf{p}_\infty = \mathbf{p}_\infty$, as desired.

- (c) Each point correspondence $\mathbf{x}_j \leftrightarrow \mathbf{x}'_j$ gives rise to four linear equations,

$$\text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}'_j = \mathbf{T} \text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_j,$$

where only the three first add anything useful. This means that we need at least four point correspondences to determine the $4 \cdot 3 = 12$ parameters in \mathbf{T} .

Answer: Four is the smallest number of point correspondences that are needed to uniquely determine \mathbf{T} .

3. (a) **Answer:** The common geometric cost function in this case sums the squared point-to-line distances, i.e.

$$\varepsilon(\mathbf{l}) = \sum_{k=1}^n \left((\text{norm}_P \mathbf{x}_k)^\top (\text{norm}_D \mathbf{l}) \right)^2.$$

- (b) To simplify the notation, assume that $\mathbf{x}_1, \dots, \mathbf{x}_n$ are already P-normalised so that all $\mathbf{x}_k = (\bar{\mathbf{x}}_k, 1)$, where $\bar{\mathbf{x}}_k = (x_k, y_k)$ are the Euclidean coordinates. Assume we use the D-normalised representation $\mathbf{l} = (\hat{\mathbf{l}}, -\Delta)$, where $\|\hat{\mathbf{l}}\| = 1$ and $\Delta \geq 0$.

We can rewrite the cost function as

$$\varepsilon(\mathbf{l}) = \sum_{k=1}^n (\mathbf{x}_k^\top \mathbf{l})^2 = \sum_{k=1}^n (\bar{\mathbf{x}}_k^\top \hat{\mathbf{l}} - \Delta)^2.$$

The optimal value for Δ is found by setting $\frac{\partial \varepsilon}{\partial \Delta} = 0$, which results in $\Delta = \hat{\mathbf{l}}^\top \bar{\mathbf{s}}$, where $\bar{\mathbf{s}} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=1}^n \bar{\mathbf{x}}_k$ is the centroid of the points.

For the optimal Δ , we get

$$\varepsilon(\mathbf{l}) = \sum_{k=1}^n (\bar{\mathbf{x}}_k^\top \hat{\mathbf{l}} - \Delta)^2 = \sum_{k=1}^n ((\bar{\mathbf{x}}_k - \bar{\mathbf{s}})^\top \hat{\mathbf{l}})^2 = \hat{\mathbf{l}}^\top \mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^\top \hat{\mathbf{l}},$$

where $\mathbf{A} = \begin{pmatrix} \bar{\mathbf{x}}_1 - \bar{\mathbf{s}} & \dots & \bar{\mathbf{x}}_n - \bar{\mathbf{s}} \end{pmatrix}$. Minimising $\hat{\mathbf{l}}^\top \mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^\top \hat{\mathbf{l}}$ over $\|\hat{\mathbf{l}}\| = 1$ corresponds to computing the rightmost singular vector of \mathbf{A}^\top .

4. (a) **Answer:** Collecting the entries in \mathbf{C} into

$$\mathbf{c} = (c_{11}, c_{12}, c_{13}, c_{14}, c_{22}, c_{23}, c_{24}, c_{33}, c_{34}, c_{44})$$

and defining

$$\mathbf{A}_k = (x_k^2 \quad 2x_k y_k \quad 2x_k z_k \quad 2x_k \quad y_k^2 \quad 2y_k z_k \quad 2y_k \quad z_k^2 \quad 2z_k \quad 1)$$

we can estimate \mathbf{c} as the null space to the data matrix

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbf{A}_1 \\ \vdots \\ \mathbf{A}_m \end{pmatrix} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times 10}.$$

- (b) We want the data matrix to have a one-dimensional null space in order to have a unique (up to scale) solution. Since $\text{rank } \mathbf{A} \leq \min(m, 10)$, the smallest number of points needed to determine \mathbf{C} is $m = 9$.

Answer: The smallest number of points needed to determine \mathbf{C} is $m = 9$.

5. (a) For \mathbf{G}_0 to define a valid scalar product, it must be symmetric and positive definite. Here, \mathbf{G}_0 is clearly symmetric, which means that we only need to find out which a make it positive definite. This can be done in several ways, for example by rewriting (i.e., expanding and then completing the squares)

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{u}^\top \mathbf{G}_0 \mathbf{u} &= (u_1 \quad u_2 \quad u_3) \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 2 & a \\ 0 & a & 2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} u_1 \\ u_2 \\ u_3 \end{pmatrix} = (u_1 \quad u_2 \quad u_3) \begin{pmatrix} u_1 \\ 2u_2 + au_3 \\ au_2 + 2u_3 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= u_1^2 + 2u_2^2 + 2au_2u_3 + 2u_3^2 = u_1^2 + 2\left(u_2 + \frac{a}{2}u_3\right)^2 + \left(2 - \frac{a^2}{2}\right)u_3^2. \end{aligned}$$

We thus need $2 - \frac{a^2}{2} > 0 \iff |a| < 2$.

Answer: The matrix \mathbf{G}_0 defines a valid scalar product precisely when $|a| < 2$.

- (b) We compute the scalar products (we only need six of them, since \mathbf{G} is symmetric), resulting in

$$\begin{aligned} \langle \mathbf{b}_1 | \mathbf{b}_1 \rangle &= \dots = 1 \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_2 | \mathbf{b}_2 \rangle &= \dots = 6 \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_3 | \mathbf{b}_3 \rangle &= \dots = 6 \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_1 | \mathbf{b}_2 \rangle &= \dots = 0 \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_1 | \mathbf{b}_3 \rangle &= \dots = 0 \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_2 | \mathbf{b}_3 \rangle &= \dots = 3 \end{aligned}$$

The Gram matrix is

$$\mathbf{G} = \begin{pmatrix} \langle \mathbf{b}_1 | \mathbf{b}_1 \rangle & \langle \mathbf{b}_2 | \mathbf{b}_1 \rangle & \langle \mathbf{b}_3 | \mathbf{b}_1 \rangle \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_1 | \mathbf{b}_2 \rangle & \langle \mathbf{b}_2 | \mathbf{b}_2 \rangle & \langle \mathbf{b}_3 | \mathbf{b}_2 \rangle \\ \langle \mathbf{b}_1 | \mathbf{b}_3 \rangle & \langle \mathbf{b}_2 | \mathbf{b}_3 \rangle & \langle \mathbf{b}_3 | \mathbf{b}_3 \rangle \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 6 & 3 \\ 0 & 3 & 6 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Answer: The Gram matrix is $\mathbf{G} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 6 & 3 \\ 0 & 3 & 6 \end{pmatrix}$.

(c) Let $\mathbf{B} = (\mathbf{b}_1 \ \mathbf{b}_2)$. The vector $\mathbf{u} \in U$ closest to \mathbf{v} is given by

$$\mathbf{u} = \mathbf{B}\mathbf{c} = \mathbf{B}\mathbf{G}_B^{-1}\tilde{\mathbf{c}} = \mathbf{B}(\mathbf{B}^\top\mathbf{G}_0\mathbf{B})^{-1}\mathbf{B}^\top\mathbf{G}_0\mathbf{v},$$

where \mathbf{c} are the subspace coordinates of \mathbf{v} and $\tilde{\mathbf{c}}$ are the subspace dual coordinates of \mathbf{v} , and $\mathbf{G}_B = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 6 \end{pmatrix}$ is the subspace Gram matrix with respect to \mathbf{B} . Carrying out the computations, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{u} &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 6 \end{pmatrix}^{-1} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 2 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 3 \end{pmatrix} = \\ &= \frac{1}{6} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 6 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 7 \\ 8 \end{pmatrix} = \\ &= \frac{1}{6} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 6 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 15 \end{pmatrix} = \frac{1}{6} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 6 \\ 15 \end{pmatrix} = \frac{1}{2} \begin{pmatrix} 2 \\ 5 \\ 5 \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

Answer: The vector $\mathbf{u} \in U$ closest to \mathbf{v} is $\mathbf{u} = (1, \frac{5}{2}, \frac{5}{2})$.

6. (a) **Answer:** The frame operator is

$$\mathbf{F} = \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top\mathbf{G}_0 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 6 & -1 \\ -1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 1 \\ 1 & 6 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 6 & -1 \\ -1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 11 & -1 \\ 0 & 5 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(b) The lower frame bound is the smallest eigenvalue of \mathbf{F} , and the upper frame bound is the largest eigenvalue of \mathbf{F} . In this case, when \mathbf{F} is triangular, we can read the eigenvalues off of the diagonal, giving $L = 5$ and $U = 11$.

Answer: The lower frame bound is $L = 5$ and the upper frame bound $U = 11$.

(c) **Answer:** The dual frame vectors are given by

$$\tilde{\mathbf{B}} = \mathbf{F}^{-1}\mathbf{B} = \frac{1}{55} \begin{pmatrix} 5 & 1 \\ 0 & 11 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} = \frac{1}{55} \begin{pmatrix} 5 & 6 & 1 & 2 \\ 0 & 11 & 11 & 22 \end{pmatrix}.$$

7. (a) The only requirement here is the internal constraint $\text{rank } \mathbf{F} = 2$, which implies $\det \mathbf{F} = 0$. It is clear by inspection that $\text{rank } \mathbf{F} \geq 2$ for all values of a and b (the first two columns, for example, cannot be made parallel). This gives the constraint

$$\det \mathbf{F} = \begin{vmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ a & 2 & b \\ a & 1 & 3 \end{vmatrix} = 6 - a - b + 2a = 6 + a - b = 0.$$

Answer: The values of a and b which make \mathbf{F} a valid fundamental matrix are those satisfying $6 + a - b = 0$.

(b) If \mathbf{x}_1 and \mathbf{x}'_1 satisfy the epipolar constraint, this means that

$$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ a & 2 & b \\ a & 1 & 3 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ a+4+b \\ a+2+3 \end{pmatrix} = 2a + b + 9 = 0.$$

Together with the internal constraint $6 + a - b = 0$, this yields $a = -5$ and $b = 1$. The epipolar line \mathbf{l}_2 is

$$\mathbf{l}_2 = \mathbf{F}\mathbf{x}'_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ -5 & 2 & 1 \\ -5 & 1 & 3 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 4 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 4 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix},$$

and we finally compute the distance as

$$d_{\text{PD}}(\mathbf{x}_2, \mathbf{l}_2) = |(\text{norm}_{\text{P}} \mathbf{x}_2)^\top (\text{norm}_{\text{D}} \mathbf{l}_2)| = \left| \frac{1}{2} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 3 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 2 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \right| = \frac{7}{2}.$$

Answer: The distance between \mathbf{x}_2 and the corresponding epipolar line is $\frac{7}{2}$.

8. (a) Since

$$\begin{aligned} \varepsilon &= \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{v}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[(\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{v})^\top (\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{v})] = \\ &= \mathbb{E}[\mathbf{v}^\top \mathbf{v} - 2\mathbf{v}^\top \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{v}^\top \underbrace{\mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top}_{=\mathbf{I}} \mathbf{v}] = \\ &= \mathbb{E}[\mathbf{v}^\top \mathbf{v} - \mathbf{v}^\top \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{v}] = \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v}\|^2] - \mathbb{E}[\mathbf{v}^\top \mathbf{B}\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{v}] = \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v}\|^2] - \varepsilon_1, \end{aligned}$$

minimising ε is equivalent to maximising ε_1 .

(b) The objective is to find a subspace that minimises the expected norm (squared) of the difference between a vector and its projection on the subspace. If \mathbf{c} are the subspace coordinates of \mathbf{v} and $\tilde{\mathbf{c}}$ are the subspace dual coordinates of \mathbf{v} , and $\mathbf{G}_{\mathbf{B}}$ is the subspace Gram matrix, then

$$\varepsilon = \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}\mathbf{c}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}\mathbf{G}_{\mathbf{B}}^{-1}\tilde{\mathbf{c}}\|^2] = \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}(\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{G}_0 \mathbf{B})^{-1} \mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{G}_0 \mathbf{v}\|^2].$$

It is also important to remember that the norm is induced by the scalar product, and thus also depends on \mathbf{G}_0 .

Answer: The expression becomes $\varepsilon = \mathbb{E}[\|\mathbf{v} - \mathbf{B}(\mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{G}_0 \mathbf{B})^{-1} \mathbf{B}^\top \mathbf{G}_0 \mathbf{v}\|^2]$.